

DECISION BoA No1-2011

as amended on 5 October 2019

Laying down the rules of organisation and procedure of the Board of Appeal of the European Union Agency for the Cooperation of Energy Regulators

THE BOARD OF APPEAL OF THE EUROPEAN UNION AGENCY FOR THE COOPERATION OF ENERGY REGULATORS,

HAVING REGARD to Regulation (EU) 2019/942 of the European Parliament and of the Council of 5 June 2019 establishing a European Union Agency for the Cooperation of Energy Regulators¹ (hereinafter "Regulation (EU) 2019/942"), and in particular Articles 25 to 28 thereof,

Whereas:

- (1) Regulation (EU) 2019/942 empowers the European Union Agency for the Cooperation of Energy Regulators, hereinafter the "Agency", to take individual decisions in the specific cases referred to in Article 2 d) and establishes a Board of Appeal to decide on appeals against these decisions.
- (2) Since only basic rules are laid down in Regulation (EU) 2019/942 regarding appeal procedures, as well as since Article 25(3) of Regulation (EU) 2019/942 requires so, it is necessary to provide for detailed rules on organisation of the Board of Appeal as well as for detailed rules of procedure applicable to appeals before that Board.
- (3) Since Recital (34) of Regulation (EU) 2019/942 applies procedural economy as an overall principle which justifies the existence of the Board of Appeal, the Board of Appeal aims

¹ OJ L 158, 14.6.2019, p. 22



to validate procedural economy through the entire appeal proceedings, in terms of the language of the procedure used, deadlines set, length of written documents and any other elements of the procedure where savings in time or in resources used can be achieved.

- (4) These Rules of Organisation and Procedure should apply also to all other cases where the Agency has been or may be empowered to take individual decisions, in particular pursuant to Regulation (EU) No 347/2013 of the European Parliament and of the Council of 17 April 2013, Art. 12(6)² and Commission Regulation (EU) 2015/1222 of 24 July 2015, Art. 9(11)³
- (5) To facilitate the handling of appeals, a Rapporteur should be designated for each case and his tasks should be determined.
- (6) To ensure that the Board of Appeal can operate smoothly and efficiently, a Registry should be established under its auspices and properly resourced.
- (7) If necessary and on the basis of experience in the application of these Rules of Organisation and Procedure, the Board of Appeal shall review the effectiveness of the provisions and their operation in practice, and amend them where appropriate,

HAS ADOPTED THESE RULES OF ORGANISATION AND PROCEDURE:

CHAPTER I

Organisation of the Board of Appeal

Section 1

The Board of Appeal

² OJ L115, 25.4.2013, p.39

³ OJ L197, 25.7.2015, p.24



Article 1

Composition

- 1. The Board of Appeal of the Agency shall comprise six members and six alternates. The alternates replace the members in the cases foreseen in these Rules of Organisation and Procedure.
- 2. The Board of Appeal shall designate a Chairperson and a Vice Chairperson from among its members. The term of office of the Chairperson shall be for a renewable period of two and a half years. The term of office shall in any case expire when the Chairperson ceases to be a member of the Board of Appeal. These provisions apply mutatis mutandis to the Vice Chairperson.

The designation of the Chairperson and the Vice Chairperson shall be by secret ballot unless the Board of Appeal decides otherwise by unanimity. In case of a secret ballot, a teller shall be designated amongst the members to assist in the counting of the vote.

- 3. The Chairperson or the Vice Chairperson, if the Chairperson is not available, shall preside over all appeals. They shall ensure the quality and consistency of the decisions of the Board of Appeal.
- 4. Each appeal shall be decided by six members or alternates of the Board of Appeal.
- 5. At the latest within three calendar weeks from the submission of a notice of appeal, the Board of Appeal through the Registry shall inform the parties of the composition of the Board that will hear the appeal, indicating also the alternates available to substitute the members of the Board should the circumstances so require. Those alternates are entitled to access the file of the case but may not discuss its content with the members of the Board of Appeal unless and insofar as the alternate will replace a member.



Article 2

Exclusion of members

1. Members or alternates of the Board of Appeal shall not take part in any appeal proceedings if they have any personal interest therein, or if they have previously been involved as representatives of one of the parties to the proceedings related to the decision under appeal, or if they participated in the decision under appeal.

If a member or alternate considers that they cannot participate in the appeal proceedings, for one of the reasons referred to in the above paragraph or for any other reason, the member or alternate must communicate it without undue delay to the Board of Appeal.

- 2. A member of the Board of Appeal shall immediately inform the Board in the event that this member, for one of the reasons referred to in paragraph 1 or for any other reason, considers that a fellow member or alternate should not take part in any appeal proceedings. Any party to the appeal proceedings may object to the participation of a member or alternate of the Board of Appeal on any of the grounds referred to in paragraph 1, or if suspected of bias. Such an objection shall be inadmissible if it is based on the nationality of a member or if, while being aware of a reason for objecting, the objecting party to the appeal proceedings has taken a procedural step in the appeal proceedings other than objecting to the composition of the Board of Appeal.
- 3. The member or alternate of the Board of Appeal concerned shall be invited to present his comments regarding the reasons for any objection before a decision is taken.

The Board of Appeal shall decide on the action to be taken in the cases specified in paragraphs 1 and 2 without the participation of the member concerned. For the purpose of taking that decision, the member concerned shall be replaced on the Board of Appeal by his alternate. If the alternate finds himself in a similar situation to that of the member or if he or she is being excluded, the Chairperson shall designate a replacement from among the available alternates.



4. The provisions contained in this Article in relation to members shall also apply to alternates replacing members pursuant to Article 3 of these Rules of Organisation and Procedure.

Article 3

Replacement of members

1. The Board of Appeal shall replace a member by their alternate where it decides to exclude him from the proceedings in accordance with Article 27(3) of Regulation (EU) 2019/942 and/or Article 2 and/or 3(2) of these Rules of Organisation and Procedure.

If a member leaves before the end of its term, that member's alternate shall take place until the Administrative Board of the Agency appoints a new member or alternate of the Board of Appeal.

2. The Board of Appeal may replace any member of the Board, at the request of that member, by his or her alternate in the event of leave, sickness, unavoidable commitments of that member or where, for other reasons, that member is precluded from participating in the proceedings.

If a member is unable to ask for replacement, the Board of Appeal may replace that member on its own initiative.

The Board of Appeal may reject a request for a replacement only by a reasoned decision.

3. In the event that an alternate called to replace a member is unable to participate in the proceedings due to any reason specified in Article 27(1) of Regulation (EU) 2019/942 or to Article 2 and/or 3(2) of these Rules of Organisation and Procedure, the next available alternate following the order in which the corresponding members appear in the appointment decision



by the Administrative Board shall be designated. The next alternate to the alternate corresponding to the member who appears as the last one in the order in which members appear in the appointment decision by the Administrative Board is the alternate corresponding to the member who appears as the first one in the order in which members appear in the same decision.

- 4. In case of replacement of a member pursuant to this Article, all rights and obligations of the member as laid down in Articles 26 and 27 of Regulation (EU) 2019/942 and in these Rules of Organisation and Procedure shall also apply to his or her alternate.
- 5. If a member or alternate is replaced, the alternate concerned shall be bound by any interim decision taken prior to that replacement.
- 6. The absence of a member after the Board of Appeal has taken a final decision shall not preclude the Board of Appeal from carrying out the remaining procedural steps.

If the Chairperson is unable to sign the decision or to carry out other remaining procedural steps, the Vice Chairperson shall carry out those steps on behalf of the Chairperson.

Article 4

Independence

- 1. The members and alternates of the Board of Appeal shall undertake to act independently and in the public interest. They shall not be bound by any instructions.
- 2. For that purpose, the members and alternates shall make a written declaration of commitments and a written declaration of interests indicating either the absence of any interest which may be considered prejudicial to their independence or any direct or indirect interest which might be considered prejudicial to their independence. Those declarations shall be given annually and entered in the Registry and shall be accessible to the public.
- 3. At each meeting related to appeal case, the members and alternates shall declare any interest which could be considered to be prejudicial to their independence with respect to any point



on the agenda. Anyone declaring such interests shall not attend any deliberations of nor participate in any voting on the relevant point.

- 4. Members and alternates shall not perform any other duties in the Agency, in its Administrative Board or in its Board of Regulators. This is without prejudice to the need for members and alternates to be kept up to date with the work of the Agency.
- 5. In implementing these provisions, due account will be taken of Decision AB No 02/2015 of the Administrative Board of the Agency of 31 January 2015 including, as an attachment, the document "Policy for the prevention and management of conflicts of interest", and in particular Art 4(2) of that document. This document is available on the Agency's website.

Article 5

Rapporteur

- The Chairperson shall designate one of the other members or, in case of replacement, alternates
 deciding an appeal as Rapporteur for the case or fulfill that function themselves, taking into
 consideration the need to ensure a balanced distribution of workload between all members and
 alternates.
- 2. The Rapporteur shall carry out a preliminary study on the merits of the appeal.
- 3. The Chairperson acting on behalf of the Board of Appeal may, upon a proposal from the Rapporteur, prescribe any of the procedural measures provided for in Article 20.
 - The implementation of those measures may be entrusted to the Rapporteur, with the assistance of the Registrar.
- 4. The Rapporteur shall prepare a draft decision.
- 5. If the member or alternate designated as Rapporteur is replaced at any stage during the appeal process, the Chairperson designates another member or alternate deciding on the appeal as



Rapporteur.

6. The Rapporteur will receive the necessary support for his or her work.

Article 6

The meetings of the Board of Appeal

- 1. The Chairperson convenes general meetings of the Board of Appeal as well as meetings related to appeal cases.
- 2. General meetings of the Board of Appeal shall be convened at least once in a calendar year by sending the invitation and the draft agenda of the meeting.
- 3. Every member and alternate member of the Board of Appeal may attend at general meetings, propose agenda items, contribute to the discussions orally or in writings and vote if decision-making takes place.
- 4. Save exceptional circumstances, general meetings of the Board of Appeal shall be held at the seat of the Agency.
- 5. Meetings can be also held by videoconference or by using other communication technology means.
- 6. Meetings related to the appeal cases shall be convened if the case at hand so requires.



Section 2

The Registry

Article 7

Registry and Registrar

- 1. The Board of Appeal shall be assisted in the exercise of its duties by the Registry headed by a Registrar, who shall be appointed by the Board on proposal of the Chairperson.
 - The Chairperson shall have the power to give directions to the Registrar on matters relating to the exercise of the functions of the Board of Appeal.
- 2. The Registry will provide the framework for the proper functioning of procedures and all related services.
- 3. The task of the Registry shall include the receipt, transmission and custody of documents, and the effecting of other services as provided for by these Rules of Organisation and Procedure. These services will also establish a source of analysis and knowledge relevant to the work of the Agency, but independent of the Agency.
- 4. A Register of appeals shall be kept in the Registry in which references to all notices of appeal and related documents are entered.
- 5. The staff of the Registry, including the Registrar, may not participate in any proceedings of the Agency relating to decisions which may be the subject of appeals.
- 6. For every case the Registrar will without delay establish a detailed time schedule for the different stages of the procedure subject to the agreement of the Chairperson and taking account of the time limits under Article 28(2) of the Regulation (EU) 2019/942.



The Registrar shall verify that the time limits and other formal conditions relating to the lodging of appeals are complied with.

- 7. The Chairperson of the Board of Appeal may delegate the power of signature to the Registrar for the purpose of setting or extending time limits and for other procedural measures which, pursuant to these Rules of Organisation and Procedure, fall to the Chairperson to prescribe.
- 8. The Registrar will keep a file of the written declarations of commitment and the written declarations of interest and assist the members and alternates in fulfilling their obligations resulting from Article 4 of the present Rules of Procedure.
- 9. The Agency will provide the necessary resources for the operation of the Registrar and the Registry.
- 10. In the absence of the Registrar or, in the event of him/her being prevented from carrying out the relevant duties, those duties shall be performed by the officer designated as Deputy Registrar or, in the event of the latter being prevented from carrying out the relevant duties, by the subordinate member of staff of the Registry present in the highest function group with the highest grade or, in the event of equal grade, the subordinate with the greatest seniority in the grade or, in the event of equal seniority, the one who is eldest.

CHAPTER II

The procedure

Article 8

Notice of appeal

1. The notice of appeal shall contain:



- (a) the name and address of the appellant;
- (b) where the appellant has appointed a representative, the name and the business address of the representative;
- (c) an address for service, if different from those under points (a) and (b);
- (d) the reference of the decision which is being contested and the remedy sought by the appellant;
- (e) the pleas in law and the arguments of fact and law relied on;
- (f) where appropriate, the nature of any evidence offered and a statement explaining the facts for which the evidence is offered in support;
- (g) where appropriate, an indication as to what information in the notice of appeal is to be regarded as confidential. Sufficient information must however be made available for a meaningful announcement pursuant to Article 8(3);
- (h) an indication whether the appellant agrees that service is to be effected on him/her or, where appropriate, on their representative by telefax, e-mail or other technical means of communication.
- 2. Where the appellant is a legal person, the instrument or instruments constituting and regulating that legal person or a recent extract from the register of companies, firms or associations or any other proof of its existence in law shall also be attached.
- 3. In order to facilitate the preparation of the announcement, the appellant shall attach to the notice of appeal a non-confidential summary of the dispute in the language of the case and in English. That summary should not exceed one page and shall include:
 - (a) the name of the appellant;



- (b) the related disputed decision;
- (c) the particulars of the remedy sought by the appellant; and
- (d) a summary of the principal grounds relied on.
- 4. If a notice of appeal does not comply with the requirements set out in paragraph 1(a) to (e) or paragraph 2, the Registrar shall prescribe a reasonable period within which the appellant is to comply with them. The Registrar may prescribe such period only once.
 - During that period, time shall not run for the purposes of the time limit set out in Article 28(2) of Regulation (EU) 2019/942.
- 5. If an irregularity is detected which is liable to make an appeal inadmissible, the Registrar shall send within one calendar week a reasoned opinion to the Chairperson.
 - Where the Registrar prescribes a period in accordance with paragraph 4, he shall send such opinion after that period has expired if the irregularity has not been corrected.
- 6. The Registrar shall circulate the notice of appeal to the Board of Appeal and to the parties of the proceeding without delay.
- 7. Where the appellant is not the addressee of the contested decision, the Registrar shall inform the latter of the lodgement of an appeal against such decision.

Article 9

Announcement of the appeal

1. An announcement shall be published on the website of the Agency, indicating the date of registration of an appeal initiating proceedings, the names and addresses of the parties,



the subject matter of the proceedings, the remedy sought by the appellant, a summary of the pleas in law and of the main supporting arguments; the date of publication of the announcement on the website of the Agency, the case number of the appeal to which it relates, and an indication of the language of the case.

The Chairperson may decide that an announcement shall contain additional information relevant to the appeal case in question.

2. The announcement shall be published within one calendar week of receipt of the notice of appeal by the Agency.

The announcement is considered to be published when it is made available to the public on the website of the Agency.

3. The announcement shall be published in the language in which the notice of appeal has been lodged and also in English in case the said language is not English.

Article 10

Defence

1. The Agency shall lodge the defence within five calendar weeks after service of the notice of appeal.

The Chairperson may, in exceptional circumstances, extend that time limit on a reasoned application by the Agency.

- 2. The defence shall contain:
 - (a) where the Agency has appointed a representative, the name and the business address of the representative;



- (b) the pleas in law and the arguments of fact and law relied on;
- (c) where appropriate, the nature of any evidence offered and a statement explaining the facts for which the evidence is offered in support;
- (d) where appropriate, an indication as to what information in the defence is to be regarded as confidential, and the reasons for the claimed confidentiality;
- (e) an indication whether the Agency agrees that service is to be effected on it or, where appropriate, on its representative, by telefax, by e-mail or other technical means of communication.
- 3. Where the Agency, despite being duly summoned, fails to lodge a defence, the proceedings shall continue without a defence.

Article 11

Intervention

- 1. Any person establishing direct and existing interest in the result of the case submitted to the Board of Appeal may intervene in the proceedings before the Board of Appeal.
- 2. An application stating the circumstances establishing the right to intervene shall be submitted within two calendar weeks from the day of the publication of the announcement referred to in Article 28(2) of Regulation (EU) 2019/942.
- 3. The intervention shall be limited to supporting or opposing, in whole or in part, the form of remedy sought by one of the parties. It shall not confer the same procedural rights as those conferred on the parties and, in particular, shall not give rise to any right to request that a hearing be held.

The intervention shall be ancillary to the main proceedings. It shall become devoid of purpose



if the case is removed from the register of the Board of Appeal as a result of a party's discontinuance or withdrawal from the proceedings, or where the notice of appeal is declared inadmissible.

The intervener must accept the case as they find it at the time of their intervention.

- 4. The application to intervene shall contain:
 - (a) the name and address of the intervener;
 - (b) where the intervener has appointed a representative, the name and the business address of the representative;
 - (c) an address for service, if different from those under points (a) and (b);
 - (d) a statement of the circumstances establishing that the applicant is directly affected by the operative part of the contested measure and that it has an interest in the result of the case;
 - (e) a statement of the remedy sought by the intervener in support of or opposing, in whole or in part, the remedy sought by one of the parties;
 - (f) the pleas in law and the arguments of fact and law relied on;
 - (g) where appropriate, the nature of any evidence offered in support;
 - (h) where appropriate, an indication as to what information in the application to intervene is to be regarded as confidential, and the reasons for the claimed confidentiality;
 - (i) an indication whether the intervener agrees that service is to be effected on him or her or, where appropriate, on his or her representative by telefax, e-mail or other technical means of communication.
- 5. The application shall also bear the signature of the intervener or their representative. Where the applicant is a legal person, the instrument or instruments constituting and regulating that legal person or a recent extract from the register of companies, firms or associations or any other proof of its existence in law shall also be attached.
- 6. The Registrar shall circulate the request of intervention to the parties of the proceeding without



delay. The parties may make observations to the application within the deadline prescribed by the Registrar.

- 7. The Board of Appeal shall decide whether or not to allow the applicant to intervene. The application for intervention not fulfilling the criteria set up in paragraph 4 will be assessed as submitted, without any invitation for regularization.
- 8. Where the Board of Appeal decides to allow the intervention, the intervener shall receive a copy of every procedural document served on the parties provided for that purpose to the Board of Appeal by the parties or shall receive an access to those documents in other appropriate way. Confidential parts of documents shall be excluded from such communication.
- 9. The intervener can make one supplementary submission concerning paragraph 4 (e)-(h). This submission must be made within 5 working days after receipt of the procedural documents according to paragraph 8.
- 10. Interveners shall bear their own costs, in accordance with Article 29 of these Rules of Procedure.

Article 12

Representation

Where a party or intervener has appointed a representative, that representative shall provide an authority to act issued by the represented party or intervener.

Any change in representation must be notified to the Registry in writing without delay.



Article 13

Lodging of procedural documents

- 1. In accordance with Article 1(5), the Registry shall inform the parties of the composition of the Board that will hear the appeal and inform them that any communication concerning the appeal must be lodged with the Registry.
- 2. For the purposes of calculating time limits, a document shall not be considered to have been lodged until it is received at the Registry.
- 3. All pleadings shall be signed by the lodging party or his representative and shall bear a date.
- 4. A party may submit documents to the Registry by hand or by post. However, the Board of Appeal allows documents of a party to be lodged by e-mail or by any other technical means of communication.

Details with regard to submission of appeals by, e-mail or other technical means of communication are set out in the Practice Directions published together with these Rules of Procedure.

Article 14

Confidentiality requests

1. A request for the confidential treatment of any information contained in a document filed in connection with proceedings before the Board of Appeal shall be made in writing at the time the document is lodged, under a separate heading of the procedural document in question or by a separate application lodged together with the principal documents.

The request shall indicate the relevant words, figures or passages for which confidentiality is claimed, together with the reasons for that request. For every confidentiality request sufficiently detailed reasons are required.



- 2. The Chairperson acting on behalf of the Board of Appeal shall evaluate, with the assistance of the Registrar, the confidentiality request pursuant to the relevant provisions of Regulation (EC) No 1049/2001 of the European Parliament and of the Council of 30 May 2001 regarding public access to European Parliament, Council and Commission documents.
- 3. After a confidentiality request has been accepted in its entirety or partially, "non-confidential" and "marked confidential" versions of the relevant document should be submitted to the Registry.

Article 15

Admissibility of the appeal

- 1. The grounds on which an appeal shall be ruled inadmissible shall include the following:
 - (a) the notice of appeal is not in compliance with the requirements set out in Article 8(1)(a) to (e), (2) and Article 13(3) of these Rules of Organisation and Procedure within the time-limit for submitting an appeal as set out in Article 28(2) of Regulation (EU) 2019/942;
 - (b) the appellant has exceeded the time limit for submitting an appeal as set out in Article 28(2) of Regulation (EU) 2019/942;
 - (c) the appeal is not brought against a decision referred to in Article 28(1) of Regulation (EU) 2019/942, or where the Agency has been otherwise given the power to take individual decisions.
 - (d) the appellant is neither an addressee of the decision contested by the appeal nor able to establish direct and individual concern according to Article 28(1) of Regulation (EU) 2019/942.
- 2. In order to avoid any unnecessary proceedings, the Chairperson of the Board of Appeal assisted by the Registrar shall examine whether the appeal is admissible without undue



delay of the appeal being filed in accordance with Article 28 of Regulation (EU) 2019/942. In the negative, they shall submit a proposal for decision of inadmissibility to the Board of Appeal. The absence of any such proposal shall not prevent the Board of Appeal from still taking a decision on the admissibility.

Article 16

Evidence

- 1. When taking decisions, subject to the provisions of the previous Article, the Board of Appeal will assess the submitted documentation and investigate the subject matter carefully and impartially. It will take into consideration all the relevant factors, and give each of them its proper weight in the decision, whilst excluding any irrelevant element from consideration. In its appraisal, the Board of Appeal will use such evidence as, after due consideration, it deems necessary in order to ascertain the facts of the case.
- 2. In order to inform its assessment, the Board of Appeal may have to gather information by obtaining documents and records as well as hearing the evidence of the parties concerned, applicants and experts, pursuant to Article 18, or collect their statements electronically or in writing. For this purpose, the Board of Appeal may issue procedural requests for information from the relevant parties pursuant to Article 20 of the present Rules and subject to the conditions specified therein.
- 3. The Board of Appeal may also conduct its own analysis and any further studies, as required.

Article 17

Examination of appeals

- 1. No further evidence may be introduced after the first exchange of written pleadings unless the Board of Appeal decides that the delay in offering the evidence is duly justified.
- 2. No new plea in law may be introduced after the first exchange of written pleadings unless



the Board of Appeal decides that it is based on new matters of law or of fact that come to light in the course of the proceedings.

3. Where appropriate, the Chairperson acting on behalf of the Board of Appeal shall invite the parties to the proceedings to submit observations on notifications issued by the Board of Appeal or on communications from the other party.

The Chairperson shall set a reasonable period for submission of the observations, duly taking into account the time constraints provided in Article 28(2) of Regulation (EU) 2019/942 of the written part of the proceedings.

Article 18

Hearings

1. The Board of Appeal shall hold a hearing if either or both parties request so.

The request shall be submitted within three working days from notification to the party of the Defence. This period may be extended by the Chairperson.

If the Board of Appeal decides to hear experts or witnesses, they have an obligation to testify and tell the truth according to best knowledge. The Board of Appeal notifies experts and witnesses of this obligation through the Registrar before the hearing taking place.

- 2. The summons to the hearing shall be communicated to the parties by the Registrar.
- 3. If a party which has been duly summoned to a hearing does not appear as summoned, the proceedings may continue without that party.
- 4. Hearings before the Board of Appeal shall be public, unless the Board of Appeal, of its own motion or at the request of a party, decides otherwise, for serious reasons. In order to allow proper time planning and compliance with the time constraint set in Article 28(2) of Regulation (EU) 2019/942, the Registrar shall publish a possible schedule for a hearing for each appeal on the Agency's website as soon as the announcement of an appeal is published.



This date will only be confirmed formally if the Board of Appeal decides to hold such a hearing in accordance with paragraph 1.

5. The hearing shall be opened and directed by the Chairperson, who shall be responsible for its proper conduct.

The Chairperson and the other members and alternates deciding on the appeal may put questions to the parties or their representatives. At the hearing where the parties communicate their final oral arguments, the Agency (as defendant) is heard last.

6. The Registrar shall be responsible for drawing up summary minutes of the hearing. A full audio record of the hearing may be recorded on an appropriate electronic device for the sole purpose of preparing the summary minutes. In that case, the parties and other persons participating in the hearing shall be duly informed in advance and offered a possibility and procedure to opt-out. Rights of the participants and other persons participating in the hearing pursuant to the European Union's legal framework on data protection will be fully complied with.

The minutes shall be signed by the Chairperson and the Registrar, which shall constitute an official record and shall be utilised to the extent necessary as evidence, within the meaning of Article 16 of these Rules of Organisation and Procedure. The minutes shall be sent to the parties by the Registrar

The Registrar shall keep the audio recordings for no longer than follow-up actions to the hearing are necessary and in any case no longer than 90 days following the last day of the hearing. After the expiration of that period, the Registrar shall delete the audio record of the hearing.

7. The hearing may be held by video conference or by using other communication technology if the technical means are available, as long as the identity of the intervening parties can be ascertained.



Article 19

Use of languages

1. The language in which the notice of appeal has been lodged shall be the language of the case on appeal.

If the appellant is the addressee of the decision against which the appeal is brought, the notice of appeal shall be lodged in the language of the decision or in one of the official languages of the Community appearing in the submission which gave rise to the decision.

The Chairperson acting on behalf of the Board of Appeal may accept to change the language of the case to another official language of the Community, if this is jointly requested by both parties and if this is compatible with the time constraint set in Article 28(2) of Regulation (EU) 2019/942. Any request to change the language of the case should be submitted within one calendar week after service of the notice of appeal to the parties of the proceeding in accordance with Article 8(6).

2. The language of the case shall be used in the written and oral proceedings and in the minutes and decisions of the Board of Appeal.

Any supporting documents in another language shall be accompanied by a translation into the language of the case.

In the case of lengthy documents, translations may be confined to extracts. However, the Board of Appeal may, of its own motion or at the request of a party, at any time require a more extensive or complete translation.

- 3. At the request of a party, and after the other party has been heard, the Chairperson acting on behalf of the Board of Appeal may authorize the use of an official language of the Community other than the language of the case for all or part of the proceedings.
- 4. Where the Board of Appeal authorizes the use of a language other than the language of the



case, the Registry shall arrange for translation or interpretation.

Article 20

Procedural measures

- 1. The Chairperson acting on behalf of the Board of Appeal may prescribe procedural measures at any point in the proceedings, either at request of the Rapporteur, or at the request of any other member, of his own motion or at the request of the parties.
- 2. The purpose of procedural measures shall, in particular, be to:
 - (a) ensure the efficient conduct of the proceedings and facilitate the taking of evidence;
 - (b) determine the points on which the parties must present further arguments;
 - (c) clarify the remedies sought by the parties, their pleas in law and arguments and the points at issue between them.
- 3. Procedural measures may, in particular, consist of:
 - (a) putting questions to the parties;
 - (b) inviting the parties to make written or oral submissions on certain aspects of the proceedings;
 - (c) asking the parties or third parties for information;
 - (d) asking for documents relating to the case to be produced;
 - (e) summoning the parties or their representatives to meetings;
 - (f) drawing attention to matters which seem to be of special significance, or to the fact that certain questions appear no longer to be contentious;
 - (g) making observations that may help to keep the focus on essentials during the proceedings;
 - (h) merging appeals on similar or connected subjects before the closure of written proceedings.



Article 21

Competence

- 1. The Board of Appeal may confirm the impugned decision of the Agency or may remit the case to the competent body of the Agency.
- 2. If the Board of Appeal remits the case to the competent body of the Agency in accordance with Article 28(5) of Regulation (EU) 2019/942, the latter shall be bound by the reasoning in the decision of the Board of Appeal save in so far as a change in circumstances occurs.
 - 3. An appeal lodged pursuant to Article 28(1) of Regulation (EU) 2019/942 shall not have suspensory effect. The Board of Appeal may, however, if it considers that circumstances so permit, order the Agency to suspend the application of the contested decision. The latter is without prejudice to the provisions under Article 27 of these Rules of Procedure on suspension of the application of the contested decision by the Board of Appeal.

Article 22

Deliberations

- 1. Deliberations shall be and shall remain secret. This shall not prevent, with the Chairperson's consent, other members or alternates attending the deliberations of those deciding the appeal.
- 2. During the deliberations, each member shall state his opinion and the reasons for it. The opinion of the Rapporteur shall be heard first and, if the Rapporteur is not the Chairperson, the opinion of the Chairperson last.

Article 23

Voting

1. If voting is necessary, votes shall be cast in the sequence provided for in the second subparagraph of Article 21(2) of these Rules of Organisation and Procedure. However, if the Chairperson is also the Rapporteur, he shall vote last.

2. Decisions shall be taken on the basis of a qualified majority of at least four of its six members/alternates.

Abstentions shall not be permitted.

3. The Chairperson may propose a written procedure by sending an express or an electronic mail with the draft decision and relevant background information. Any member may, within seven calendar days, raise written objections or may request to convene an extraordinary meeting. The voting rules of paragraphs 1 and 2 apply mutatis mutandis. In case of urgency the Chairperson may shorten that period to three working days.

In case of serious objections, the Chairperson may decide whether the written procedure is suspended and an extraordinary Board of Appeal meeting should be convened, or whether the revised draft decision, together with the serious objections, should be re-circulated to all Board members and the written procedure should be continued. In the latter case, a new three working days period for objections shall be started.

Meetings can also be held by video conference or by using other communication technology means.

Article 24

Decisions

1. The decision shall contain:



- (a) a statement that the decision is delivered by the Board of Appeal;
- (b) the date when the decision was taken;
- (c) the names of the members of the Board of Appeal who have taken part in the proceedings;
- (d) the names of the parties to the appeal and their representatives in the proceedings;
- (e) a statement of the remedy sought by the parties;
- (f) a summary of the facts;
- (g) the grounds on which the decision is based;
- (h) the operative part of the decision of the Board of Appeal.
- 2. The Chairperson and the Registrar shall sign the decision. The signatures may be electronic.

 The original of the decision shall be deposited at the Registry.
- 3. The decision shall be served on the parties in accordance with Article 25 of these Rules of Procedure.
- 4. The decision shall be accompanied by a statement that it may be challenged pursuant to Article 263 of the Treaty on the Functioning of the European Union and Article 29 of Regulation (EU) 2019/942. The statement shall include the time limit for commencing that action.

Failure to include that statement shall not render the decision invalid.

5. Final decisions of the Board of Appeal shall be published in full on the public website of the Agency, unless the Chairperson decides otherwise on the reasoned request of a party. An associated press release may also be published.

Prior to publishing the final decision of the Board of Appeal, the appellant shall be granted the possibility to indicate whether certain information mentioned in the decision is confidential. The procedure as described in Article 14 shall in this respect be followed.



Article 25

Service of documents

The Registrar shall ensure that the decisions and communications of the Board of Appeal are served on the parties.

Service shall be effected by one of the following means:

- 1. registered post with a form for acknowledgement of receipt;
- 2. personal delivery of the copy against a receipt;
- 3. any technical means of communication available to the Board of Appeal which the party or its representative has agreed to accept for such purposes.

Article 26

Time limits

- 1. Any period prescribed by or set under Regulation (EU) 2019/942 or these Rules of Organisation and Procedure for the purposes of appeal proceedings shall be calculated in accordance with paragraphs 2 to 6 of this Article.
- 2. Where a period expressed in days, weeks, months or years is to be calculated from a day on which an event occurs or an action takes place, that day shall not be considered as falling within the period in question.
- 3. A period expressed in days shall start at the beginning of the first hour of the first day and shall end with the expiry of the last hour of the last day of the period.



4. A period expressed in weeks, months or years shall start at the beginning of the first hour of the first day of the period, and shall end with the expiry of the last hour of whichever day in the last week, month or year is the same day of the week, or falls on the same date, as the day during which the event or action from which the period is to be calculated occurred or took place.

If, in a period expressed in months or in years, the day on which it should expire does not occur in the last month, the period shall end with the expiry of the last hour of the last day of that month.

- 5. Where a period is expressed in months and days, it shall first be calculated in whole months, then in days.
- 6. Periods shall include official holidays of the Agency, Saturdays and Sundays, save where the periods are expressed in working days.
- 7. If a period would otherwise end on a Saturday, Sunday or official holiday of the Agency, the period shall end with the expiry of the last hour of the first following working day.

Article 27

Suspension of the application of the contested decision

- 1. Upon application of a party to the proceeding or of its own motion, the Board of Appeal may suspend the application of the contested decision.
- 2. The application to suspend the application of the contested decision shall be admissible only if the applicant has challenged that decision in an action before the Board and if the application was submitted together with that action.



- 3. The application shall state the circumstances giving rise to urgency and the pleas of fact and law establishing a prima facie case for the suspension applied for as well as that the applicant's interest in the imposition of interim measures outweighs other interests at stake in the proceedings.
- 4. The application shall be served on the opposite party, and the Chairperson shall prescribe a short time-limit within which that party may submit written observations.

The decision on the application shall take the form of a reasoned order not subject to appeal. The order shall be served on the parties forthwith.

Article 28

Withdrawal of an appeal

Where an appeal is withdrawn, the Chairperson shall close the proceedings. This closure will be published on the public website of the Agency.

Article 29

Allocation of costs

All parties and interveners carry their own cost that may result from the application of any provisions of these Rules of Organisation and Procedure.



Article 30

Rectification

The Board of Appeal may, after hearing the parties, of its own motion or on application by a party made within one month after the decision has been served, rectify clerical mistakes, errors in calculation and obvious mistakes in the decision.

CHAPTER III

Final provisions

Article 31

Implementing measures

- 1. These Rules of Organisation and Procedure are adopted by the Board of Appeal on the basis of a qualified majority by two thirds of its members and alternates.
- 2. The Board of Appeal may adopt additional decisions containing measures which implement the provisions laid down in these Rules of Organisation and Procedure in further detail.

These Rules of Organisation and Procedure are published on the public website of the Agency upon their adoption.



Article 32

Entry into force

This decision shall take effect on the day following that of its adoption.
Done at Ljubljana, on 05.10.2019
For the Board of Appeal,
Andris Piebalgs
Chairperson of the Board of Appeal